Quality Assurance
Implications of High-Impact Practices and Related Improvement Efforts

George D. Kuh

NMHEAR Preconference Workshop
February 28, 2013
Overview

- A word about our times, student success, and quality assurance
- NILOA – who we are, what we do
- Degree Qualifications Profile
- Introduction to High-Impact Practices
- Activity
- Discussion
US Economy Defined by Greater Workplace Challenges and Dynamism

- More than 1/3 of the entire US labor force changes jobs *ANNUALLY*.

- Today's students will have 10-14 jobs by age 38.

- Half of workers have been with their company less than 5 years.

- Every year, more than 30 million Americans are working in jobs that did not exist in the previous year.
The World is Demanding More

- More college educated workers.
- Higher levels of learning and knowledge for all college graduates.
Employer expectations of employees have increased

**% who agree with each statement**

Our company is asking employees to **take on more responsibilities** and to **use a broader set of skills** than in the past  

91%

Employees are expected to **work harder to coordinate with other departments** than in the past  

90%

The **challenges** employees face within our company are **more complex today** than they were in the past  

88%

To succeed in our company, employees need **higher levels of learning and knowledge** today than they did in the past  

88%
Narrow Learning is Not Enough: The Essential Learning Outcomes

★ Knowledge of Human Cultures and the Physical & Natural World
★ Intellectual and Practical Skills
★ Personal and Social Responsibility
★ “Deep” Integrative Learning
Deep, Integrative Learning

➢ Attend to the underlying meaning of information as well as content
➢ Integrate and synthesize different ideas, sources of information
➢ Discern patterns in evidence or phenomena
➢ Apply knowledge in different situations
➢ View issues from multiple perspectives
Key Capabilities Open the Door for Career Success and Earnings

“Irrespective of college major or institutional selectivity, what matters to career success is students’ development of a broad set of cross-cutting capacities…”

Anthony Carnevale, Georgetown U.
Center on Education and the Workforce
The World is Demanding More

- More college educated workers.
- Higher levels of learning and knowledge for all college graduates.
- Assurance of quality
“I think you should be more explicit here in step two.”
Student Success in College

Academic achievement, engagement in educationally purposeful activities, satisfaction, acquisition of desired knowledge, skills and competencies, persistence, attainment of educational objectives, and post-university performance
What Are the Critical Quality Assurance Questions?

What you want to say.

What they're interested in.

Relevance
1. To what degree do students benefit from attending your university in terms of:
   • Academic achievement, content knowledge, and cognitive/intellectual skills;
   • Practical competencies and personal development;
   • Degree attainment;
   • Employment; and
   • Post baccalaureate study?
2. What enriching educational opportunities are available and how many students take advantage of them? What distinctive opportunities are provided to students?

3. What evidence suggests students are able to integrate and apply what they learned?
4. What are the net costs for the typical resident and nonresident student to attend this institution? What factors influence the cost for students?

5. What internal institutional processes assure the quality of student learning? How are the results of these processes used to enhance student learning?
NILOA

NILOA’s mission is to discover and disseminate effective use of assessment data to strengthen undergraduate education and support institutions in their assessment efforts.

- Surveys
- Web Scans
- Case Studies
- Focus Groups
- Occasional Papers
- Website
- Resources
- Newsletter
- Listserv
- Presentations
- Transparency Framework
- Featured Websites
- Accreditation Resources
- Assessment Event Calendar
- Assessment News
- Measuring Quality Inventory
- Policy Analysis
- Environmental Scan

www.learningoutcomesassessment.org
Register for NILOA’s First Webinar
Tue, Sep 25, 2012 - 08:00 am
NILOA

Please register for Assessment and the Degree Qualifications Profile on Oct 5, 2012 12:00 PM CDT at:

https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/register/6494929608888819200

This webinar is the first in a series on assessment within the Degree Qualifications Profile (DQP). The webinar will provide a brief overview of assessment resources and institutional activity as it relates to the DQP.

After registering, you will receive a confirmation email containing information about joining the webinar.

How Europe Tracks Students
Mon, Sep 24, 2012 - 08:00 am
Doug Lederman in Inside Higher Ed

Highlighting how vital data tracking is to quality assessment, this article argues for better federal and state methods for gathering and making student data available for accountability and to aid institutional improvement purposes.
NILOA resources include reports, tools, briefs, papers, and updates that support institutions in their outcomes assessment efforts.
TRANSPARENCY
National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment
Making Learning Outcomes Usable & Transparent

http://www.learningoutcomesassessment.org/TransparencyFramework.htm
NILOA

NILOA’s mission is to discover and disseminate effective use of assessment data to strengthen undergraduate education and support institutions in their assessment efforts.

- Surveys
- Web Scans
- Case Studies
- Focus Groups
- Occasional Papers
- Website
- Resources
- Newsletter
- LISTSERV
- Presentations
- Transparency Framework
- Featured Websites
- Accreditation Resources
- Assessment Event Calendar
- Assessment News
- Measuring Quality Inventory
- Policy Analysis
- Environmental Scan
- Degree Qualifications Profile

www.learningoutcomesassessment.org
National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment
Making Learning Outcomes Usable & Transparent

Welcome to NILOA


In the News | Archive | RSS

Register for NILOA’s First Webinar
Tue, Sep 25, 2012 - 08:00 am
NILOA

Please register for Assessment and the Degree Qualifications Profile on Oct 5, 2012 12:00 PM CDT at:
https://attendee.gotowebinar.com/register/644969926988819200

This webinar is the first in a series on assessment within the Degree Qualifications Profile (DQP). The webinar will provide a brief overview of assessment resources and institutional activity as it relates to the DQP.

After registering, you will receive a confirmation email containing information about joining the webinar.

How Europe Tracks Students
Mon, Sep 24, 2012 - 08:00 am
Doug Lederman in Inside Higher Ed

Highlighting how vital data tracking is to quality assessment, this article argues for better federal and state methods for gathering and making student data available for accountability and to aid institutional improvement purposes.
Why a DQP
or
Why Emphasize Degree-Level Expectations/Outcomes

Shift the focus from *what is taught* to *what is learned* by providing institutions with a template of widely agreed-upon competencies required for the award of degrees.
Degree Qualifications Profile

✓ A learning outcomes profile
✓ Competency demonstrated through performance
✓ At degree levels aligned with expectations for the respective degree
✓ For five key “consensus” learning areas
Degree Qualifications Profile

Civic Learning

Applied Learning

Intellectual Skills

Broad, Integrative Knowledge

Specialized Knowledge

Associate

Bachelor

Master’s
Degree Qualifications Profile

- DQP builds on research about how people learn and is designed to ensure both knowledge and ability to integrate and apply.

- DQP builds on LEAP and other efforts that have credibility among faculty, and includes outcomes already endorsed by accreditors and employers.
LEAP Essential Learning Outcomes

• **Knowledge of Human Cultures and the Physical and Natural World**
  → **Focused** on engagement with big questions, enduring and contemporary

• **Intellectual and Practical Skills**
  → **Practiced** extensively across the curriculum, in the context of progressively more challenging problems, projects, and standards for performance

• **Personal and Social Responsibility**
  → **Anchored** through active involvement with diverse communities and real-world challenges

• **Deep, Integrative Learning**
  → **Demonstrated** through the application of knowledge, skills, and responsibilities to new settings and complex problems
Degree Qualifications Profile

• Knowledge – both integrated and applied
  → using Broad/Integrative knowledge
  → demonstrating Specialized knowledge

• Intellectual Skills
  → honed and integrated across the curriculum, applied to challenging problems

• Civic Learning
  → demonstrated ability to integrate the work of responsible citizenship

• Applied Learning
  → demonstrated through assignments involving research, projects, creativity
Degree Qualifications Profile

- A learning outcomes profile
- Competency demonstrated through *performance*
- At degree levels aligned with expectations for the degree
- For five key “consensus” learning areas
- For benchmarking and experimentation: a *beta version* for testing and further development
It might leave a little too much room for rationalization. Maybe you should try breaking it down to a few specifics...

Moses and the First Draft

Don't do bad things
NILOA’s role with the DQP

NILOA is “harvesting” (collecting, analyzing, summarizing, synthesizing) what can be learned from all of the funded and unfunded work currently going on with the DQP
Regional Accreditors
• ACCJC (15)
• HLC (23)
• SACS (22)
• WASC (28)

Organizations
• AASCU (6 in 3 state systems)
• AAC&U (21)
• CIC (25)

States
• Oregon (24)

http://www.learningoutcomesassessment.org/DQPNew.html#Funded
NILOA and the DQP

✓ Document what is being done, by whom, and distill lessons learned in current DQP projects at the campus/system level—tracking current and relevant future work;

Share your DQP story? What are you doing? Who is involved? What are you learning? What assistance do you need?

Tell us via the DQP Institutional Activity Report: https://illinois.edu/fb/sec/704337
NILOA and the DQP

✓ **Document what is being done, by whom, and any lessons learned** in current DQP projects at the campus/system level—mapping current work;

✓ **Identify synergies and cross-cutting issues** that will enable Lumina to provide timely assistance, and help project leaders and campuses find allies dealing with similar issues;

✓ **Provide support to campuses**—promoting promising practices, addressing challenges, sharing lessons and models (with special attention to student assessment);

✓ **Gather information to help guide the upcoming revision of the DQP.**
What We’re Learning Across Projects

- DQP is a conversation starter: offers a common vocabulary for talking about outcomes
- Curricular mapping: Where are students mastering these competencies? Where are the gaps?
- Certify transfers, align and “streamline” systems
- Faculty engagement and ownership are essential, which take time
- Doing assessment right is a continuing, perennial challenge.
The DQP Vision of Assessment

• Integral to teaching and learning, not an add-on “exo-skeleton”
• Focuses on what students can do – action verbs
Occasional Paper #16

The Degree Qualifications Profile: Implications for Assessment

Peter T. Ewell & Carol Geary Schneider

This paper offers guidance for how to gather evidence about the extent to which the competencies described in the DQP are mastered at the levels claimed. The challenges associated with assessing DQP proficiencies are outlined.

www.learningoutcomeassessment.org/OccasionalPapers.htm
Faculty must drive assessment

- Identify which competencies described in the DQP they address in their courses/labs/studios
- Identify which competencies are major objectives (probably only a few)
- Map those competencies to the existing relevant assignments
- Tweak existing or create new assignments/student work to elicit the appropriate student behavior
Faculty must drive assessment

- Validate competence through assignments:
  - lab specifications
  - test questions
  - performance protocols
  - exhibit instructions
  - field work questions
  - paper topics with rubrics
Valid Assessment of Learning in Undergraduate Education (VALUE) Rubrics

- Inquiry and analysis
- Critical thinking
- Creative thinking
- Written communication
- Oral communication
- Reading
- Quantitative literacy
- Information literacy
- Teamwork
- Problem solving
- Civic knowledge and engagement
- Intercultural knowledge and competence
- Ethical reasoning and action
- Foundations and skills for lifelong learning
- Integrative learning
The DQP Vision of Assessment

• Integral to teaching and learning, not an add-on “exo-skeleton”
• Focuses on what students can do – action verbs
• For all students, not just a sample
• Cumulative and connected
What enriching educational opportunities are available and how many students take advantage of them? What distinctive opportunities are provided to students?
High-Impact Activities

- First-Year Seminars and Experiences
- Common Intellectual Experiences
- Learning Communities
- Writing-Intensive Courses
- Collaborative Assignments and Projects
- “Science as Science Is Done”; Undergraduate Research
- Diversity/Global Learning
- Service Learning, Community-Based Learning
- Internships
- Capstone Courses and Projects
Graduation Rates by Ethnicity and Participation in High-Impact Practices

Source: CSU Northridge Institutional Research August, 2010

- Latino/a:
  - 0: 38%
  - 1: 49%
  - 2: 65%
  - 3+ : 73%

- not Latino/a:
  - 0: 55%
  - 1: 63%
  - 2: 68%
  - 3+: 69%
% saying each would help a lot/fair amount to prepare college students for success

**84%**
Students complete a significant project before graduation that demonstrates their depth of knowledge in their major AND their acquisition of analytical, problem-solving, and communication skills (*62% help a lot*)

**81%**
Students complete an internship or community-based field project to connect classroom learning with real-world experiences (*66%*)

**81%**
Students develop research skills appropriate to their field and develop evidence-based analyses (*57%*)

**73%**
Students work through ethical issues and debates to form their own judgments (*48%*)
Common Intellectual Experiences

When students read and write or conduct inquiries about the same material, they are more likely to:

- talk about substantive matters outside of class
- study together
- see connections between different courses
- integrate and synthesize material
Learning Communities

- Formal program where groups of students (FY) take two or more classes together
- LC programs that integrate material across courses are associated with greater student engagement and learning
First-Year Student Number of Hours Studying by Learning Community Status

Hours

- 0
- 1-5
- 6-10
- 11-15
- 16-20
- 21-25
- 26-30
- More than 30

LC
Non-LC
Service Learning

- Community-based project as part of a regular course
- Positively associated with deep learning and personal development
Research with a Staff Member

- Majority utilized existing info (libraries, WWW), and almost half worked in laboratory and fieldwork settings
- Reviewing literature and interpreting findings most closely related to deep learning
- Data collection had the weakest relationship
Study Abroad

- Positively related to engagement and learning outcomes upon return to home campus
- Living with host nationals related to more integrative and reflective learning, and personal and social gains
- Length of time spent abroad did not make a difference
Culminating Activities

- Capstone course, senior project or thesis, comprehensive exam, field placement
- A third (32%) of seniors reported having completed such an experience
- Another 29% said they planned to do so before graduating
### Effects of Participating in High-Impact Activities on Deep/Integrative Learning and Gains

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Deep Learning</th>
<th>Gains General</th>
<th>Gains Personal</th>
<th>Gains Practical</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First-Year</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Communities</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Senior</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Abroad</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-Faculty Research</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culminating Experience</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+ p < .001, ++ p < .001 & Unstd B > .10, +++ p < .001 & Unstd B > .30
## Effects of Participating in High-Impact Activities on Student Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Activity</th>
<th>First-Year</th>
<th>Senior</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Level of Academic Challenge</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active and Collaborative Learning</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-Faculty Interaction</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supportive Campus Environment</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning Communities</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Abroad</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student-Faculty Research</td>
<td>+++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>+++</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culminating Experience</td>
<td>++</td>
<td>++</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

+ p < .001, ++ p < .001 & Unstd B > .10, +++ p < .001 & Unstd B > .30
HIP Benefits

• High-impact practices have been shown to be positively related to
  – Persistence
  – GPA
  – Deep approaches to learning
  – More frequent student-faculty interaction
  – Enhanced critical thinking
  – Improved writing skills
  – Greater appreciation for diversity
  – Higher overall student engagement

• Impact is often larger for underserved students

Impact of High-Impact Activities Enhanced When Students:

✓ Strive to reach expectations set at appropriately high levels
✓ Invest time and effort
✓ Interact with faculty and peers about substantive matters
✓ Experience diversity
✓ Get more frequent feedback
✓ Reflect & integrate learning
✓ Discover relevance of learning through real-world applications
✓ Demonstrate competence publicly
Keep in Mind…

✓ More college experiences can be or are “high impact” in addition to those on the AAC&U list
✓ Implementation quality matters!
✓ Implications for advising
High-Impact Practices and the Disparities Within...

Frosh: Service Learning and LCs

- Parity among racial/ethnic groups
- Fewer 1st gen students
- Fewer part-time students
- Fewer transfer students
- Fewer older students
High-Impact Practices and the Disparities Within…

Seniors in All HIPs

- Fewer 1\textsuperscript{st} gen students
- Fewer students of color
- Fewer transfer students
- Fewer part-time students
- Fewer older students
Faculty Perceptions

- How important is it to faculty that undergraduates do HIPs? (“very important” or “important”)
  - Culminating experience (85%)
  - Internship/Practicum (86%)
  - Learning community (53%)
  - Research with faculty (56%)
  - Study abroad (44%)
Keep in Mind…

✅ More college experiences can be or are high impact in addition to those on the AAC&U list

✅ Implementation quality matters!

✅ Implications for advising

✅ The characteristics of high-impact activities can be infused into any classroom, lab, studio or other learning setting
What If ... 

**Every student** had *at least one* “high-impact” experience in the first year and another later linked to the major
Activities

- How can you determine which HIPs are available at your school and which students do them?
- What are some other potential HIPs at your school?
- What procedures are need to insure that HIPs are of high quality?
- What assessment approaches will work best with which HIPs?
- How can you generate interest in HIPs at your school?
- What other issues do you want to discuss related to HIPs?
Assessing Student Engagement in High-Impact Practices

To what extent does your institution provide these experiences?
[√ = have on campus; √ = required; estimate the % of various student populations in these activities]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>On Our Campus</th>
<th>Learning Community</th>
<th>First Year Seminars</th>
<th>Research w/ Faculty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Required for all</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Students involved</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% First Generation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Transfer Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% African American</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Latino Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Asian American</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Adult Students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What if...

We made student employment a high-impact activity.
Supervisors had two structured conversations with every student employee during spring semester and coded conversations into the following categories:

- How the job and academics complement each other (“How is your job fitting in with your academics?”)
- Transfer between work and academics (“What are you learning here at work that is helping you in school?”)
- Transfer between academics and work (“Are you learning anything in class that you can apply here at work?”)
- Transfer between work and future career (“Give me a couple of examples of things that you are learning here at work that you will be using in your future profession?”)
U of Iowa Student Employment Project
“Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

- Student Employment Survey used to examine differences between pilot and non-pilot participants.
## Student Employment Outcomes: “Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>% agree/strongly agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pilot Participants</strong></td>
<td><strong>Non-Pilot Participants</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My supervisor helps me make connections between my work and my life as a student.</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped prepare me for the world of full-time work.</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped me improve my written communications.</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Student Employment Outcomes: “Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>% agree/strongly agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pilot Participants</td>
<td>Non-Pilot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I can see connections between my job and my major/coursework.</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped me learn about career options.</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Student Employment Outcomes: “Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>% agree/strongly agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pilot Participants</strong></td>
<td><strong>Non-Pilot</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Because of my job, I am able to work effectively with individuals with a variety of backgrounds, experiences, and cultures.</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>77%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job has helped me use critical thinking skills</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Student Employment Outcomes: “Guided Reflection on Work” (GROW)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>% agree/strongly agree</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pilot Participants</td>
<td>Non-Pilot Participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job helped me develop more effective time management skills.</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>76%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job helped me improve my oral communication skills.</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My job helped me develop conflict resolution skills.</td>
<td><strong>74%</strong></td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Activities

- How can you determine which HIPs are available at your school and which students do them?
- What are some other potential HIPs at your school?
- What procedures are needed to ensure that HIPs are of high quality?
- What assessment approaches will work best with which HIPs?
- How can you generate interest in HIPs at your school?
- What other issues do you want to discuss related to HIPs?
Final Thoughts

- Make sure HIPs are done well
  - Seven features that make HIPs effective
- The state of HIP participation on campus
- Equal opportunities for all
- Connections to positive outcomes
- Generating interest
  - Faculty are key!
Don't EVER give up!